



(PHOTO: ISTOCKPHOTO)

Legalise organ trade



LEOW JU-LEN

THE organ trade should be legalised.

When you make the sale of something valuable and in high demand illegal, you create a black market for it and, with it, a host of accompanying problems.

Make prostitution illegal and an unsavoury type might feel at liberty to beat up a whore, for instance. It's not like she could turn to the police for help.

Make alcohol illegal, as the US did in 1920, and you fuel the rise of gangs and bootleggers.

Make organ trading illegal and you fuel the rise of butchers. If you can't have a kidney legally taken out in a hospital, you may be having it done in far more dangerous conditions. And done by a far more dangerous person than a well-scrubbed surgeon who shies away from shady deeds.

What's needed instead is a legal framework within which the legitimate buying and selling of human organs can take place, with regulations in effect to prevent exploitation.

'Organ trading fair, if both sides willing'

In light of the recent kidney-trading case, Star Bloggers on citizen media website Stomp were asked to comment on the topic: "There's a willing seller. And there's a willing – and even desperate – buyer. So, what's all the fuss about trading organs?" Here are excerpts from their posts.

Visit www.stomp.com.sg to read the Star Bloggers' views in full.

OK if there's consent



JAMIE YEO

I'M NOT here with answers today because I'm aware that it is somewhat of a Pandora's box that we're dealing with.

I think the safest bet is to view this with as much compassion as we can muster and to realise that not everything in this world is black or white.

Sometimes, we have to take on each situation individually and not apply the same set of ethics and rules all the time.

It's like a teacher dealing with her students. You can't apply the same methods and give the same encouragement and attention to all of them because they all come from different backgrounds, environments, etc.

If I were to be in a situation where I needed an organ transplant to live, you can be sure that I'd be doing anything and everything I could to get hold of a willing donor.

As long as there's consent, money and everything else will not be a problem.

I'm sorry. I don't want to die.

It's win-win situation



DAWN YANG

IS IT wrong to sell an organ to help yourself out of poverty and, in the process, help save someone's life?

Let's take a more specific example here.

Let's say I'm in dire straits, jobless for months, and dead

broke. So I decide to sell my house, my car, my TV and auction off my Chanel and Balenciagas on eBay.

I'm selling all these precious possessions of mine to willing buyers who would be very happy with their new house, car, TV or gorgeous bags.

And I, too, would be very happy that I have money to eat and survive.

If I have a family to feed, it would be even more cause for celebration that I found a way

to better our hard lives by selling some of the things I own.

Two satisfied parties.

Win-win situation, no?

Simple business transaction, no?

So why on earth is it corrupt to sell or to buy a personal possession like an organ?

Women in China and India sell their hair to make wigs, for goodness' sake.

Furthermore, trading in organs isn't even done for superficial, materialistic reasons, but as a means to save a life.

Let's not be hypocritical



DYLAN TAN

MY VIEWS on organ trading? Let he who is not sick shut up.

Who should have the right to dictate that organ trading is a criminal offence?

I would like to know if those who are against organ trading are also going through the pain of daily dialysis treatments? And did their doctors recently

tell them that they have a very slim chance of crossing the five-year survival mark?

To make my point clear, I am not implying that the sick should have special privileges to break the law. I am also not saying that we should condone exploitation of the poor. Of course not!

What I am saying is: Don't be a hypocrite!